

MA New Media and Society in Europe

Internet Censorship, Control and Governance

Term:

Fall 2022

Course convener:

Prof. Trisha Meyer

Email: trisha.meyer@vub.be
Office: Pleinlaan 5, Floor -1 -1.65

Office hours: I would be happy to meet and discuss! Please reach out to me by email

Teaching assistant:

Carlos Entrena Serrano

Email: carlos.entrena@vub.be
Office: Pleinlaan 5, Floor +1

Course description:

In 1996 John Barlow wrote his Declaration of Independence of Cyberspace. The Internet would not be controlled by governments or the industry, it would be governed by the Internet community itself. That multistakeholder aspiration remains, but seems far off now.

Governments regulate and control the Internet in different policy fields and have started to question the suitability of early rules passed in the 2000s in today's online environment. In a policy environment that seems to evolve from data leaks and security threats to disinformation and health emergencies, tech companies have been requested and have taken on an active role in moderating content, impacting our opportunities for expression on a daily basis.

This bears the question: what is Internet governance, which principles guide policy and tech development, who has effective control, and what role should the Internet community play?

This course introduces students to Internet censorship, control and governance. It gives an overview of select international institutions governing the Internet and focuses on current policy debates in Internet governance, related to content moderation in particular. It discusses select central themes, such as digital sovereignty, censorship, and freedom of expression, disinformation and distrust, artificial intelligence and tech regulation, cyber diplomacy and norms.

After taking this course, students should demonstrate a critical understanding of:

- Founding guiding principles, state of affairs and discussions on the future of Internet governance
- Role, functioning of and challenges facing institutions involved in Internet governance

• Interactions between government, industry and civil society and principles guiding international policy debates related to Internet governance

Course time: Wednesday, 09:00-11:00

Course location: D2.10

Please always check the <u>VUB timetable</u> and the Canvas course announcements in advance, as this is subject to change.

Please take note in the course schedule below that the sessions might still swap weeks. Canvas modules will list the up-to-date order of topics.

Course schedule:

Week	Date	Topic	Additional information / invited speaker
1	21 Sep	No class	VUB welcome week
2	28 Sep	Introduction. Theorizing Internet governance	
3	05 Oct	Internet governance institutions	Orsolya Gulyás
4	12 Oct	Disinformation and distrust	Samuel Cipers
5	19 Oct	Trustworthiness of Artificial Intelligence	Submit group paper topic and question on Canvas (19/10, 23:59)
			Carlos Entrena Serrano and Ana Fernandez Inguanzo
6	26 Oct	Online censorship	Leo Van Audenhove
7	2 Nov	No class	Work on group paper
8	09 Nov	Digital sovereignty	Orsolya Gulyás and Jamal Shahin
9	16 Nov	Group paper presentations	Submit group presentation on Canvas (15/11, 23:59), present in class (16/11)
10	23 Nov	Platform governance	Nathalie Van Raemdonck
11	28 Nov-02 Dec	Internet Governance Forum	Register in advance and attend at least 2 sessions (online)
12	7 Dec	Cyber diplomacy and norms	Michael Van Aendenhof
13	14 Dec	Sustainable development goals and digital governance	Nadia Tjahja
14	21 Dec	Conclusion. Future of Internet governance	Submit group paper on Canvas (21/12, 23:59)

Compulsory course readings (per week):

Introduction. Theorizing Internet governance

- Kurbalija, J. (2016) An Introduction to Internet Governance. Geneva:
 DiploFoundation. Introduction. (pp. 5-16 and <u>browse</u> pp. 17-32)
- DeNardis, L. (2014) The Global War for Internet Governance. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press. Chapter 1. The Internet Governance Oxymoron. (pp. 1-25)

Ziewitz, M. and Brown, I. (2013) A Pre-History of Internet Governance. In Brown, I. (Ed.). Research Handbook on Governance of the Internet. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar. (pp. 3-26)

Internet governance institutions

- Kurbalija, J. (2016) An Introduction to Internet Governance. Geneva:
 DiploFoundation. Internet Governance Actors. (pp. 225-244)
- Shahin, J. (2010) The Role of the International Telecommunication Union.
 Wereldbeeld: Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor de Verenigde Naties 34(154) 11-16.
- Internet Governance Forum (2015). Background Paper. Available at: https://www.intgovforum.org/cms/2015/IGF.24.06.2015.pdf
- ICANN (2013) What Does ICANN Do? Available at: https://youtu.be/IJY5xJKPhjA (watch)
- LACNIC and ICANN (2014) What You Need to Know About IANA. Available at: https://youtu.be/Lk5j25nmZKY (watch)

Disinformation and distrust

- Van Raemdonck, N. & Meyer, T. (in press) Why Disinformation is Here to Stay. A Socio-Technical Analysis of Disinformation as a Hybrid Threat. In L. Lonardo (Ed). *Addressing Hybrid Threats: European Law and Policies*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar. Available at: https://researchportal.vub.be/en/publications/why-disinformation-is-here-to-stay-a-socio-technical-analysis-of-
- Michlin-Shapir, V. (2020). The Long Decade of Disinformation. A Review Essay.
 Defence Strategic Communications 9 17-33. Available at: https://stratcomcoe.org/publications/the-long-decade-of-disinformation/13

Trustworthiness of Artificial Intelligence

- Coeckelbergh, M. (2020) Artificial Intelligence, Responsibility Attribution, and a Relational Justification of Explainability. Science and Engineering Ethics 26(4) 2051– 2068. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/s11948-019-00146-8
- Gaumond, E. (2021) Artificial Intelligence Act: What Is the European Approach for AI? Lawfareblog (4 June 2021). Available at: https://www.lawfareblog.com/artificial-intelligence-act-what-european-approach-ai
- Mann, M. and Matzner, T. (2019) Challenging Algorithmic Profiling: The Limits of Data Protection and Anti-Discrimination in Responding to Emergent Discrimination. *Big Data & Society 6(2)* 2053951719895805. Available at: https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/2053951719895805

Censorship

- Roberts, M. (2018) Censored. Distraction and Diversion Inside China's Great Firewall.
 Princeton: Princeton University Press. Chapter 2 (pp. 21-92)
- Freedom on the Net (2021) The Global Drive to Control Big Tech. Available at: https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-net/2021/global-drive-control-big-tech (browse)
- Freedom on the Net (2020) *The Pandemic's Digital Shadow*. Available at: https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-net/2020/pandemics-digital-shadow (browse)

Digital sovereignty

- Obendiek, A. (2021) Take Back Control? Digital Sovereignty and a Vision for Europe.
 Hertie School Jacques Delors Centre (May 2021). Available at:
 https://www.delorscentre.eu/en/publications/detail/publication/take-back-control-digital-sovereignty-and-a-vision-for-europe
- Pohle, J. and Thiel, T. (2020) Digital Sovereignty. *Internet Policy Review 9(4)* 1-19. Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.14763/2020.4.1532

Platform governance

- Gillespie, T. (2018) Custodians of the Internet. Platforms, Content Moderation, and the Hidden Decisions that Shape Social Media. New Haven: Yale University Press. Chapter 8. What Platforms Are, and What They Should Be. (pp. 197-213)
- Helberger, N., Pierson, J. & Poell, T. (2018) Governing Online Platforms: From Contested to Cooperative Responsibility. *The Information Society 34(1)* 1–14.

Cyber diplomacy and norms

- Barrinha, A., & Renard, T. (2017) Cyber-Diplomacy: The Making of an International Society in the Digital Age. *Global Affairs*, *3*(*4-5*) 353-364.
- Meyer, P. (2020) Norms of Responsible State Behaviour in Cyberspace. In: Christen, M., B. Gordijn and M. Loi (Eds) The Ethics of Cybersecurity. The International Library of Ethics, Law and Technology, vol 21. Cham: Springer. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-29053-5_18 (pp. 347-360)

Sustainable development goals and digital governance

- Global Commission on Internet Governance (2016) One Internet. Centre for
 International Governance Innovation and Chatham House. Available at:
 https://www.cigionline.org/sites/default/files/gcig_final_report_-with_cover.pdf Preface
 and The Essentials. (pp. i-ix browse)
- UN Secretary-General's High-Level Panel on Digital Cooperation (2019) The Age of Digital Interdependence. Geneva: United Nations. Executive Summary. Available at: https://www.un.org/en/pdfs/DigitalCooperation-report-for%20web.pdf (pp. 4-6 - browse)
- Internet Society (2015) The Internet and Sustainable Development.
 https://www.internetsociety.org/resources/doc/2015/the-internet-and-sustainable-development/
- Global SDG Indicator Platform. https://sdg.tracking-progress.org/ (browse 4.4.1 Proportion of Youths and Adults with Information and Communications Technology skills; 5.b.1 Mobile Telephone Ownership (female); 17.6.2 Fixed Internet Broadband subscriptions per 100 inhabitants; 17.8.1 Individuals using the internet)

Conclusion. Future of Internet governance

Radu, R. (2019) Negotiating Internet Governance. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
 Chapter 7. Conclusion. Reflections on a Global Issue Domain. Available at:
 https://oxford.universitypressscholarship.com/view/10.1093/oso/9780198833079.001.0

 https://oxford.universitypressscholarship.com/view/10.1093/oso/9780198833079.001.0
 https://oxford.universitypressscholarship.com/view/10.1093/oso/9780198833079.001.0
 https://oxford.universitypressscholarship.com/view/10.1093/oso/9780198833079.001.0
 https://oxford.universitypressscholarship.com/view/10.1093/oso/9780198833079.001.0

Recommended course readings:

These readings are a carefully curated list of highly relevant insights, specific to each week's topic. They will be helpful in gaining a deeper understanding of Internet censorship, control and governance as well as being a gateway for the research paper assignment.

- Abbate, J. (1999) Inventing the Internet. Cambridge, MA: MIT press.
- Barrinha, A., & Renard, T. (2017) Cyber-Diplomacy: The Making of an International Society in the Digital Age. *Global Affairs*, *3*(*4-5*) 353-364.
- Benkler, Y., Faris, R. & Roberts, H. (2018) *Network Propaganda. Manipulation, Disinformation, and Radicalization in American Politics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bennett, W. L., & Livingston, S. (Eds.). (2020). The Disinformation Age: Politics, Technology, and Disruptive Communication in the United States. Cambridge University Press.
- Bhandari, A., & Bimo, S. (2022). Why's Everyone on TikTok Now? The Algorithmized Self and the Future of Self-Making on Social Media. *Social Media + Society 8(1)* 20563051221086240. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1177/20563051221086241
- Birhane, A. (2021) Algorithmic Injustice: A Relational Ethics Approach. *Patterns 2(2)* 100205. Available at: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2666389921000155
- Bontcheva, K., Posetti, J., Teyssou, D., Meyer, T., Gregory, S., Hanot, C. & Maynard, D. (2020) Balancing Act: Countering Digital Disinformation while Respecting Freedom of Expression. Broadband Commission research report on 'Freedom of Expression and Addressing Disinformation on the Internet'. Geneva and Paris: ITU and UNESCO.
- Brousseau, E., Marzouki, M. and Méadel, C. (2012) *Governance, Regulations and Powers on the Internet*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brown, D., Esterhuysen, A. & Kumar, S. (2019) Unpacking the GGE's Framework on Responsible State Behaviour: Cyber Norms. Association for Progressive Communications and Global Partners Digital. Available at: https://www.apc.org/sites/default/files/UnpackingGGGCyberNorms.pdf
- Brown, I. (Ed.) (2013) Research Handbook on Governance of the Internet. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.
- Brown, I. and Marsden, C. (2013) Regulating Code: Good Governance and Better Regulation in the Information Age. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Coeckelbergh, M. (2020). AI Ethics. MIT Press. Cambridge, MA: https://doi.org/10.7551/mitpress/12549.001.0001
- Christou, G. and Simpson, S. (2011) The European Union, Multilateralism and the Global Governance of the Internet. *Journal of European Public Policy* 18(2) 241-257. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1080/13501763.2011.544505
- Creemers, R. (2020) China's Conception of Cyber Sovereignty. In Broeders, D. & B. Berg (Eds.) *Governing Cyberspace: Behavior, Power and Diplomacy* (pp. 107–145). Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Deibert, R. (2014) *Black Code: Inside the Battle for Cyberspace.* Toronto: McClelland & Stewart.
- DeNardis, L. (2014) *The Global War for Internet Governance.* New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- DeNardis, L., Cogburn, D., Levinson, N. and Musiani, F. (Eds.) (2020) Researching Internet Governance: Methods, Frameworks, Futures. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. Available at: https://direct.mit.edu/books/book/4936/Researching-Internet-GovernanceMethods-Frameworks
- Drake, W. and Wilson III, E. (Eds.) (2008) Governing Global Electronic Networks: International Perspectives on Policy and Power. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

- Epstein, D. (2013) The Making of Institutions of Information Governance: The Case of the Internet Governance Forum. *Journal of Information Technology* 28(2) 137–49.
- Floridi, L. (2020) The Fight for Digital Sovereignty: What It Is, and Why It Matters, especially for the EU. *Philosophy & Technology* 33 369–378. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/s13347-020-00423-6
- Falkner, G., Heidebrecht, S., Obendiek, A. and Seidl, T. (2022). *Digital Sovereignty Rhetoric and Reality*. Paper presented at the online conference (28-29 April 2022).
- Gagliardone, I. (2019) China, Africa, and the Future of the Internet. London: ZED.
- Gillespie, T. (2018) Regulation of and by Platforms. In Burgess, J., Marwick, A. & Poell, T. (Eds.) *The SAGE Handbook of Social Media*. London: SAGE. (pp. 254–78)
- Global Commission on the Stability of Cyberspace (2019) Advancing Cybersecurity.
 The Hague Centre for Strategic Studies and the EastWest Institute. Available at: https://cyberstability.org/report/
- Graham, G. (2001) The Internet :// A Philosophical Inquiry. London: Routledge.
- Haggart, B., Tusikov, N. and Scholte. J.A. (Eds.) (2021) *Power and Authority in Internet Governance. Return of the State?* London: Routledge.
- Helberger, N., Pierson, J. & Poell, T. (2018) Governing Online Platforms: From Contested to Cooperative Responsibility. *The Information Society 34(1)* 1–14.
- Karizat, N., Delmonaco, D., Eslami, M. and Andalibi, N. (2021) Algorithmic Folk Theories and Identity: How TikTok Users Co-Produce Knowledge of Identity and Engage in Algorithmic Resistance. *Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction 5(CSCW2)* 1–44. https://doi.org/10.1145/3476046
- Kettemann, M. (2020) The Normative Order of the Internet. A Theory of Rule and Regulation Online. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Available at: https://fdslive.oup.com/www.oup.com/academic/pdf/openaccess/9780198865995.pdf
- Kleinwächter, W., Kettemann, M., Senges, M. and Mosene K. (Eds.) (2020) *Towards* a Global Framework for Cyber Peace and Digital Cooperation: An Agenda for the 2020s. Hamburg: Hans-Bredow-Institut, DEU. Available at: https://www.hans-bredow-bred
 - institut.de/uploads/media/default/cms/media/05sk62i_Kleinwa%CC%88chter,%20Ket temann,%20Senges%20%28eds.%29,%20Global%20Framework%20for%20Cyber %20Peace%20%282019%29.pdf
- Kurbalija, J. (2016) *An Introduction to Internet Governance.* Geneva: DiploFoundation.
- Kużelewska, E., Terzis, G. Trottier, D. & Kloza, D. (Eds.) (2020) *Disinformation and Digital Media as a Challenge for Democracy*. European Integration and Democracy Series, Vol. 6. Cambridge: Intersentia.
- King, G., Pan, J. & Roberts, M.E. (2013) How Censorship in China Allows Government Criticism but Silences Collective Expression. *American Political Science Review, May*, 1-18.
- Lessig, L. (2006) Code. Version 2.0. New York: Basic Books.
- Mann, M. and Matzner, T. (2019) Challenging Algorithmic Profiling: The Limits of Data Protection and Anti-Discrimination in Responding to Emergent iscrimination. *Big Data & Society 6(2)* 2053951719895805. Available at: https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/2053951719895805
- Marsden, C., Meyer, T. & Brown, I. (2020) Platform Values and Democratic Elections: How Can the Law Regulate Removal of Digital Disinformation? Computer Law and Security Review 2020 (April 2020) 105373. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2019.105373
- Miao, W. and Ang, P.H. (2016) Internet Governance: From the Global to the Local. *Communication and the Public 1(3)* 377–84. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1177/2057047316667737
- Michlin-Shapir, V. (2020). The Long Decade of Disinformation. A Review Essay.
 Defence Strategic Communications 9 17-33. Available at: https://stratcomcoe.org/publications/the-long-decade-of-disinformation/13

- Mueller, M. (2010) *Networks and States. The Global Politics of Internet Governance.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Mueller, M. (2017) Will the Internet Fragment? Sovereignty, Globalization and Cyberspace. London: Polity Press.
- Musiani, F. (2012) Caring About the Plumbing: On the Importance of Architectures in Social Studies of (Peer-to-Peer) Technology. *Journal of Peer Production 2012(1)*. Available at: https://hal-mines-paristech.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-00771863/document
- Nye, Jr., J.S. (2016) Deterrence and Dissuasion in Cyberspace. *International Security* 41(3) 44-71.
- Obendiek, A. (2021) Take Back Control? Digital Sovereignty and a Vision for Europe.
 Hertie School Jacques Delors Centre (May 2021). Available at:
 https://www.delorscentre.eu/en/publications/detail/publication/take-back-control-digital-sovereignty-and-a-vision-for-europe
- Pohle, J. and Van Audenhove, L. (Eds.) (2017) Special Issue: Post-Snowden Internet Policy. *Media and Communication 5(1)*. Available at: https://www.cogitatiopress.com/mediaandcommunication/issue/view/59
- Pohle, J. and Thiel, T. (2020) Digital Sovereignty. *Internet Policy Review 9(4)* 1-19. Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.14763/2020.4.1532
- Radu, R. (2019) Negotiating Internet Governance. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Radu, R., Kettemann, M., Meyer, T. and Shahin, J. (Eds.) (2021) Special Issue Entrepreneurship in Internet Governance. *Telecommunications Policy 45(6)*. Available at: https://www.sciencedirect.com/journal/telecommunications-policy/vol/45/issue/6
- Reviglio, U. and Agosti, C. (2020) Thinking Outside the Black-Box: The Case for Algorithmic Sovereignty. Social Media. Social Media + Society 6(2) 2056305120915613. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1177/2056305120915613
- Risse, M. (2019) Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence: An Urgently Needed Agenda. Human Rights Quarterly 41(1) 1-16. Available at: https://www.hks.harvard.edu/publications/human-rights-and-artificial-intelligence-urgently-needed-agenda-0
- Roberts, M. (2018) *Censored. Distraction and Diversion Inside China's Great Firewall.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Rugge, F. (2019) The Global Race for Technological Superiority: Discover the Security Implications. ISPI report. Available at: https://www.ispionline.it/it/pubblicazione/global-race-technological-superiority-discover-security-implications-24463
- Sandvig, C., Hamilton, K., Karahalios, K. and Langbort, C. (2014) Auditing
 Algorithms: Research Methods for Detecting Discrimination on Internet Platforms.
 Paper presented at *Data and Discrimination: Converting Critical Concerns into Productive Inquiry*" preconference to the 64th Annual Meeting of the International Communication Association (22 May 2014). Available
 at: https://social.cs.uiuc.edu/papers/pdfs/ICA2014-Sandvig.pdf
- Shen, H., DeVos, A., Eslami, M. and Holstein, K. (2021). Everyday Algorithm Auditing: Understanding the Power of Everyday Users in Surfacing Harmful Algorithmic Behaviors. *Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction* 5(CSCW2) 1–29. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1145/3479577
- Shahin, J. (2006) A European History of the Internet. *Science and Public Policy* 33(9) 681-693.
- Smuha, N. A. (2019) The EU Approach to Ethics Guidelines for Trustworthy Artificial Intelligence. *Computer Law Review International* 20(4) 97-106. Available at: https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3443537
- Swiss Institute of Comparative Law (2015) Comparative Study of Blocking, Filtering and Take-Down of Illegal Internet Content. Strasbourg: Council of Europe.
- Taylor, L. (2016). The Ethics of Big Data as a Public Good: Which Public? Whose Good? Available at: *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A.*

- *Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences 374(2083)* 20160126. Available at: https://royalsocietypublishing.org/doi/full/10.1098/rsta.2016.0126
- Tjahja, N., Meyer, T., Shahin, J., (2022). Who do you think you are? Individual stakeholder identification and mobility at the Internet Governance Forum. *Telecommunications Policy*, *46*(10), 102410. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.telpol.2022.102410
- Thumfart, J. (2022) The Norm Development of Digital Sovereignty between China, Russia, the EU and the US: From the Late 1990s to the Covid-Crisis 2020/21 as Catalytic Event. In Hallinan, D, Leenes, R. and de Hert, P. (Eds.) *Enforcing Rights in a Changing World. Computers Privacy Data Protection (CPDP) 14.* London: Hart Publishing. (pp.1–44).
- Tsamados, A., Aggarwal, N., Cowls, J., Morley, J., Roberts, H., Taddeo, M. and Floridi, L. (2021) The Ethics of Algorithms: Key Problems and Solutions. *Al* & *Society*. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/s00146-021-01154-8
- Van Raemdonck, N. & Meyer, T. (in press) Why Disinformation is Here to Stay. A Socio-Technical Analysis of Disinformation as a Hybrid Threat. In L. Lonardo (Ed). *Addressing Hybrid Threats: European Law and Policies*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar. Available at: https://researchportal.vub.be/en/publications/why-disinformation-is-here-to-stay-a-socio-technical-analysis-of-
- Walmsley, J. (2020) Artificial Intelligence and the Value of Transparency. Al & Society 36 585–595. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/s00146-020-01066-z
- Wardle, C. and Derakhstan, H. (2017) Information Disorder: Toward an Interdisciplinary Framework for Research and Policy Making (DGI(2017)09), Shorenstein Center on Media, Politics and Public Policy at Harvard Kennedy School for the Council of Europe, https://shorensteincenter.org/information-disorder-framework-for-research-and-policymaking
- West, S. (2018) Searching for the Public in Internet Governance: Examining Infrastructures of Participation at NETmundial. *Policy & Internet 10 (1)* 22– 42. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1002/poi3.143

Course assessment:

The final grade will be based on a combination of a group presentation and paper in class (25%) and an individual oral exam (75%).

The group assignment (25%) consists of a literature review and a case study on a research topic related to Internet Censorship, Control and Governance. Students form groups of 3 students and submit their topic + question by Wednesday 19 October, 23:59 (Week 5). Students will present their work in class on Wednesday 16 November, 09:00-11:00 (Week 9) and finally submit their paper by Wednesday 21 December, 23:59 (Week 14). The presentation and the paper are both worth 12.5% of the final grade. The group is assessed collectively, with feedback provided on the research topic, presentation and paper.

The individual oral exam (75%) consists of two initial exam questions with related follow-up questions. Students are allowed to briefly prepare their responses to the initial exam questions at the start of the exam. For the oral exam, students need to process all course material (reading material, slides, lecture notes) – from Week 1 through Week 14. Knowledge and insights gained from attending IGF sessions are complementary, not compulsory for the oral exam.